

# The Institute

**for** Retail Studies

## **The Retail Planning Knowledge Base Annual Update (2010 Publications)**

Anne Findlay and Leigh Sparks  
Institute for Retail Studies,  
Stirling Management School,  
University of Stirling  
STIRLING FK9 4LA, SCOTLAND  
Tel: (01786) 467384  
E-mail: [Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk](mailto:Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk)  
[a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk](mailto:a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk)  
Website [www.irs.stir.ac.uk](http://www.irs.stir.ac.uk)

March 2011

## CONTENTS

### COMMENTARY

### RETAIL PLANNING KNOWLEDGE BASE UPDATE 2011

1. General Texts
2. Theoretical Work
3. Retail Formats
4. Retail Locations
5. Retail Planning Practice
6. Consumer Culture
7. Urban Environment
8. A selection of literature relating to retail planning in USA and Europe
9. Practitioner literature

**COMMENTARY**

## 2010 Commentary

This commentary explores the retail planning literature 2010. This takes thinking on retail planning in a different direction from the past, with a new focus emerging on small shops, localism and place making. This contrasts with our annual literature reviews over recent years, when interest focused on the preparation and publication of PPS4. Whether such new concerns will survive the new Government's onslaught against planning ('a chronic obstacle') remains to be seen.

The literature in 2010 reveals a switch in interest with much greater attention being paid to small shops and to the significance of local retail places. This change in emphasis in part reflects how UK retail planning has been challenged by the changing political and economic context. In the literature there is some concern about the way that planning, property and competition are being linked. For example Hallsworth (3/3) states that 'the Competition Commission seems to be positioning itself as the key arbiter of how the UK retail market could, indeed must, evolve'. For the Competition Commission to step outside of its role as a regulator of the operating behaviour of companies into planning is a major challenge to the premises on which land-use planning has been established. Eaglesfield (5/10) believes planning will still be more important for retail location than competition-based tests. The **Barker Report** took an economic perspective rather than a planning perspective but made recommendations for the future of retail planning. These were taken up by PPS4 with the abandoning of the needs test. Throughout 2010 the pages of **Planning** magazine have recorded several instances where in the absence of the needs test councils have struggled to choose between competing bids for developments in sequentially preferable sites (**Planning**, 23/7/10, p.3.). On several occasions they have been accused of unfair practices or the case has gone to judicial review. Dundee (**Planning**, 2/7/10, p. 7), and Marlborough (**Planning**, 11/6/10, p.4) are examples.

### Small Shops

In 2010 there were an extraordinarily large number of articles and publications on the theme of small shops. Groups such as the Association of Convenience Stores have been lobbying on behalf of small shops for many years. They were instrumental in the 2006 All-Party

Parliamentary Small Shops Group on **High Street Britain 2015** study which was the catalyst to the remittal of the groceries sector to the Competition Commission. The outcome of the Competition Commission, in the form of the proposed competition test, is unlikely to make conditions more favourable for small shops in the grocery sector given the focus on the largest grocery stores, the ten minute drive time (Hughes et al., 5/18) and the view that the market is split into main grocery and top-up shopping markets.

The study by Clarke and Banga (3/1) provides a systematic review of the role of small shops in terms of their social and economic roles. One of their key conclusions, arising from the evidence on small shop use, is that small shops are an essential part of consumer store assortments and that the division identified between top up and main shopping is not meaningful in terms of consumer behaviours and is therefore not an appropriate way to regulate the sector. They recognise that small shops perform not just a utilitarian function but also contribute to a sense of belonging to places. This challenge to the utilitarian econometric perspective of the Competition Commission is significant.

The New Economics Foundation has always championed local high streets and independent shops. Although there are questions regarding the research methodologies they adopt, their 2010 report (4/2) reiterates their emphasis that small shops and local high streets matter. Their work has been much cited and seems to resonate with a wider sense that places matter and that a utilitarian perspective on shopping is too limited.

Implicit in that perspective is the belief that planning is engaged with a fair distribution of resources and provision of facilities across all groups. Small shops are seen as a key element in a retail mix. They provide appropriate services for various groups of people. The European Commission '**Report and consultation towards more efficient and fairer retail services in the internal market for 2020**' points to 'Fairer' as being as important as efficient (8/3).

Caraher et al. (6/2) explore the role of food access in making healthy food options available. The article contrasts the experience of two very different areas in Preston each with a different ethnic representation. It shows that the small shops in the Asian area provide a much better range of affordable healthy food options than what is available outwith supermarkets in the white working class area. The article makes a plea for much more attention to be given to the specifics of local areas taking account of multiple perspectives again recognising that there is not one potential outcome or approach to resolving issues of affordable healthy food

but some which may involve small shops. This theme is also taken up by Weingaertner and Barbour (3/7) who see the lack of recognition of the role of small shops during regeneration as poor practice and seek much greater engagement of the small shop sector in the process of regeneration.

Bedore (6/1) has taken some of this thinking further in the context of food deserts. She has suggested that a 'lens of justice' is the right way to look at urban foodscapes. The justice context marks a move towards recognition that there needs to be a greater concern for non-economic outcomes in retail planning for food provision. Although not specifically concerned with the role of small shops this study does suggest a repositioning of thinking to emphasis a value system which sees retail provision as involving a community based approach. It underlines the feeling that shopping provision has a place-based and community aspect to it. Interestingly the shift of some public health functions from the NHS to local authorities (5/2, 9/13) also impacts on retailing through the way that planning impacts on decision making over the provision of affordable healthy food. Initial results from the Change 4 Life investment in fruit and vegetables in small convenience stores seems to suggest that this has increased their trade, although no impacts on diet have been published (9/6).

There has always been an ethnographic interest in small shops.

Everts (8/4) demonstrates the social networking role of small shops even in urban situations. Although the study focused on ethnic shopkeepers, a key finding from the study was that it was not the ethnicity that defined the meaning of the shops in local shopping practices or shaped shopping behaviours. 'Consuming', in the small shop context is shown to be a more subtle process involving interpersonal relationships focused on meeting points, trust and certainty. Bedore (6/1) suggests that post capitalist approaches to consumption and retailing should be part of the food justice agenda. This again gives support for the view that the non-utilitarian aspects of the small shop are an important part of why small shops matter and why they are a necessary part of the retailscape.

PPS4 included a statement about the importance of retail diversity, which has now been widely interpreted as meaning small shops. This has served to turn attention to what planning can achieve for small shops and the search for planning solutions to maintaining small shop provision.

A key theme in the literature has been the need to understand the relationship between supermarket development and small shop decline. Wrigley et al. (5/23) have carried out research which seeks to repeat the 1992-1996 DETR study of the impact of large superstores and large foodstores on market towns and district centres. The period 2007-2009 is used to obtain before and after data on eight centres with interviews of traders and consumers. It is concluded that edge of centre stores do not have a negative impact on existing centres and indeed may have positive benefits in generating linked trips and encouraging clawback and more localised shopping. Hastings (5/14) has written a critique of Wrigley et al.'s (5/23) report on behalf of the Association of Convenience Stores. Hastings notes that Wrigley et al. focus on the averages rather than on the range of views and responses achieved, which might imply different findings. Equally the time frame used is seen as being too short. Hallsworth (3/3) weighs into the discussion about the relationship between small shops and supermarkets in an article entitled 'Small shop decline: shadow boxing in the dark?'. The article critiques the work of Sadun which found a positive association between small shop survival and supermarket expansion. Hallsworth draws attention to the diversity of the small shop sector and the variations in small shop fortunes in relation to supermarket development. Significantly he also draws the discussion into a wider context questioning the 'privileging of economic standpoints over more socially oriented perspectives' and noting that there is a need to be sure that small shop growth is being sustained, which is far from established from existing data analysis.

Attention has turned to the actual makeup of town centres and the fact that applications to town centres are of course not subject to the same evaluation in terms of impact on the centre as stores locating in less sequentially preferred sites. CABE (5/1) have sought to show that the way such developments fit into existing town centre structures can be critical in terms of the effect on existing shops. Guy (5/12) also notes that there is a need to think more carefully about how these stores are accommodated, emphasising the fact that the presence or absence of a store is only part of the story and that the location of the store and its integration with the rest of the retail fabric is important. The disadvantages of town centre supermarkets were the focus of a House of Commons debate (5/17), in terms of noise and nuisance but also with respect to the fact that frequently no change of class use is required and currently properties may be amalgamated to give bigger units without added permissions.

The London Assembly (3/5, 3/6) has taken a particular interest in small shops in its boroughs. They have commissioned detailed studies to document small shop provision. The work has been used as a basis for thinking about how the very important role of small shops in borough centres can be maintained through planning interventions. Key to the London Assembly thinking is the concept of 'lifetime neighbourhoods' where access to public transport, basic amenities, local shops and green spaces are within easy reach of home. A proposal which has received some publicity in the journal **Planning** is that there should be a change to class use categories which in some way would make small shops, defined as 80 sq m or less, to be a 'class' (**Planning** 30/7/10, p.1, 12/3/10, 2, 16/7/10, 4 ). The idea would be that this could be used to maintain small shop clusters and also to prevent small units being merged and taken over by multiples. They have suggested that it might be feasible to have a definition of 'essential services' which might include post office, grocer, greengrocer, baker, butcher, chemist and newsagent which could be used as a 'class' to protect small shops from changing to other uses. Sprinks notes that many of these uses are add-ons to supermarkets and discusses some of the implications of this process. Section 106 agreements have also been looked at to see if they can be used to ensure the provision of new small shop units and support existing small shops. The possible prescription that new developments should include small shops as part of the development would appear to be more problematic. A study in Canada by Grant and Perrot (8/5) of mixed use developments is one example. This particular study however also highlights the question of whether such small shops are economically viable.

Most of the literature cited so far makes little reference to issues of small shop viability from a business perspective, nor of the attractiveness or otherwise of running a small shop in today's environment. Coca-Stefaniak et al. (3/2) contrast small shops in Spain and Perth (Scotland). Results show that differences in understanding of place are significant in who the marketing is directed to. Important differences also exist in the support for small retailers with support more localised in Spain. A different understanding of how to become local is seen as important in the positioning of small shops in the market. Cross-cultural differences between Spain and the UK underline differences of attitude and approach to the sector, which are informative in focusing attention on the future of small shops.

Jones (7/8) notes the changing distribution of institutional investment in retail property showing the move of these investors away from high street properties and towards shopping

centre or non-retail investments. This has implications for maintenance and property values in the sector.

Jackson and Watkins (7/7) make the comment that there is a lack of understanding in planning of market actors (in their case in the retail property context) which limits the extent to which the state can use what they term as 'market levers' to steer the market towards more socially just outcomes.

Within retail planning there seems some consensus that small shops matter but rather less awareness of the business realities facing small shopkeepers. The National Retail Planning Forum has always sought to bring all 'actors' together and the interest in small shops and the potential of planning to encourage small shops, draws attention to the need to have that cross-sector focus.

## **Localism**

Before the election the various parties laid out some of their proposals with respect to planning. These are ably considered in a paper by Guy (5/13). Since the formation of the coalition it has been more difficult to know how the proposals of the Conservative and Liberal Democrat Parties would come together. For example would the Conservative Party act on their avowed intention of reintroducing the needs test? How would the Liberal Party bring forward their desire for greater control of competition at the local level? Key to Conservative policy is the unpicking of the centralised system operated by Labour involving abolishing regional spatial strategies and local development frameworks in favour of new local plans. The local plan would be a bottom-up plan involving collaborative democracy at the lowest level, with the engagement of all residents in a neighbourhood participating in the plan making process. This is going ahead as a coalition policy with the publication of the **Localism Bill** (5/9) and the replacement of regional spatial strategies (RSS) with a new planning framework. Guy (5/11) considers this unlikely to impact on retail planning but we shall see.

The new emphasis on localism has been welcomed by many planners (see **Planning**, 17/12/10,p.9, 17/12/10) although whether the involvement of local people which is integral to the policy will be workable remains to be seen as does the extent to which this way of

operating will create fairness. In principle the emphasis on localism provides for local people to have a greater say in the type of retail facilities they wish. Anti-superstore lobbyists may see this as an opportunity to push forward their agendas. However, one of the messages of the Localism Bill is that there should be an emphasis on stimulating growth at the local level with financial incentives. How the balance between free marketeers and those more concerned with the social nexus remains unclear.

There was concern initially that PPS4 might be threatened by the new planning framework. The town centre emphasis has been restated on several occasions by Eric Pickles the minister now responsible. At the Association of Convenience Stores Conference ‘The Heart of the Community’ his speech affirmed the new government’s intentions to continue their commitment to town centres. In the introduction to his paper he says, ‘ It’s a pleasure to be here today to talk to you about the importance of our town centres. Town centres are at the heart of our communities and neighbourhoods. They are places where we come together, to shop, to work, to relax and to be entertained.... I can confirm to you today we continue to support a town centres first policy’ (5/21). A House of Commons debate in December further confirmed commitment to town centres when Andrew Stunell, under-secretary of State for Communities and Local Government said, ‘Town centres and local high streets are certainly extremely important. They are seen as being at the heart of the community....they are civic as well as retail spaces: places where people can meet and greet, set up charity stalls or have their petitions signed. That is clearly distinct from the rather regulated world of shopping malls and retail centres. It is vital that we create the right environment for local businesses to thrive and support economic growth and regeneration in our high streets’ (5/16). During the February debate on the Localism, the Minister for Communities and Local Government, noted that ‘it is crucial that we respect and, where possible, look to strengthen the role of our high streets ‘ (5/15). Eric Pickles has also announced that there will be an end to government intervention on car parking with local councils free to set charges appropriate to the local shopping provision ([www.communities.gov.uk/news/newsroom/1809347](http://www.communities.gov.uk/news/newsroom/1809347) ). At present these policies seem to indicate that high streets remain a focus for retail planning. In another initiative the coalition government have published a **Meanwhile Use Lease** document which is intended to facilitate the take up of empty shop properties on a short term basis in order to keep town centres looking vibrant (5/5). The Meanwhile Use Lease obviates some of the planning issues such as change of use applications.

## **Making Places**

Recession has drawn attention to the need for places to be robust and resilient. Rising retail vacancies have many implications for the health of town centres and more specifically (but less recorded) in secondary retail locations. The recessionary environment has also resulted in the postponement and cancellation of developments. Some commentators have viewed the changing fortunes of the retail sector as an opportunity to re-emphasise civic aspects of town centres (9/19).

Recession is also changing town centres. The use of CVAs have been used to limit the damage of a multiple retailer bankruptcy. But from the perspective of property owners and high streets they are controversial and potentially damaging. They change the balance of power between property owner and lessee (7/5). A study of investors' decisions to invest in high street shop properties found that more proactive towns with management schemes are more attractive as there is greater demonstrable commitment to the future of the high street (7/7). Two papers by Teller and Elms distinguish evolved shopping districts from planned shopping developments (2/5, 2/6). They show that attractiveness of places is determined by factors such as tenant mix, product range and atmosphere, regardless of format. The implications of this are that there is a need for retailers in evolved formats (town centres, high streets) to work more closely together to ensure that they have an attractive offer in terms of product range, tenant mix and atmosphere.

In the literature on BID's there is an increasing awareness that social and civic roles of towns should receive greater attention. There is of course concern about the future of BID's in recession, when vacant properties reduce resources to the BID and when local authority funding is restricted. The place making agenda has come to the fore in BID's and is the likely future emphasis. It has been stated that this must not mean a uniformity of places but a diversity of places. A Royal Society of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce (7/11) conference on **Business Improvement districts: connecting business and the community** concluded that the future of BID's required greater engagement with the community. In the BID's literature there is an increasing awareness that social and civic roles of towns should receive greater attention. A paper on the role of social enterprises in town centre regeneration further emphasises this (7/6). Grossman (7/4) notes that the success of BID's should be assessed in terms of its contribution to social capital, public entrepreneurship and public private

partnership. The article stresses the integral importance of the collective, rather than the economic success of the individual, and of the contribution to the community which BIDs can offer. Localism will also require greater engagement of the community. Cox (4/2), in the New Economics Foundation report **Re-imagining the high street**, describes a scenario for the future which integrates with the concept of the 'Big Society' in terms of creating vital high streets based on local community initiatives from tool sharing to local credit schemes using concepts such as transition towns.

In Scotland there has been an emerging determination to focus on town centres as a locale. This was perhaps stimulated by the Town Centre Regeneration Fund initiative. Issues such as whole town strategies, what works in town centre regeneration and the importance of networking and sharing of experience have added to the literature on town centre regeneration (7/10). No similar focus seems to have been adopted elsewhere. This represents a further level of place making as part of the planning agenda.

## **Conclusions**

In the face of an increasingly economic-based approach to planning policy, the references in this year's update would appear to suggest that there are many who wish to take retail planning forward in a different direction. PPS4 with its references to diversity and its town centre first focus is in tune with that, but many believe it does not have the powers to achieve it. Whilst all agree that town centres should be the sequentially preferable location for new development, the importance of the civic and social dimensions of town centres have been re-emphasised by academics and practitioners. There has also been a strong assertion that small shops really matter and that they have much to contribute to the identity of places. Interesting suggestions have been made for planning initiatives to help small shops, with use classes emerging as the top option. The causal links between planning and small shops, in terms of their decline following supermarket expansion, have turned out to be considerably more complex than suggested. It remains unclear that planning can resolve small shop issues. The re-engagement with the social aspects of shop provision and shopping is an important marker in beginning to take a less economic view of retail planning and an approach focused on making places. Whether localism can help deliver such an approach is not yet clear but the emphasis on town centres as civic places with vibrant retailing is still top of the agenda.

Ironically in the section on material from Europe it is interesting to note the extent to which other countries are looking to UK retail planning policies for inspiration. Baker and Wood (8/1) for example use UK retail planning policy in thinking about the importance of the vitality and viability of town centres as they face the challenges of deregulated trading hours. They see a need for better definitions of formats and improved impact testing. Studies in the Czech Republic are also engaged with attempting to make up for the consequences of unregulated development and also speak of the importance of impact tests, citing UK examples of planning policy as a template (8/8, 8/9, 8/10).

So, 2010 sees something of a contrast or even divergence. The literature is about town centres and small shops and the non-economic focus. The UK Government on the one hand seems supportive, but on the other sees planning as a problem for growth. Both these viewpoints seem unlikely to co-exist peacefully. With new Enterprise Zones and planning to be rolled back in England what does it mean for retail planning? Yet again the literature seems out-of-step with the harsh economic realities. Is this a reaction to the economic hegemony or simply a lack of understanding of how much the economic world has changed?

**RETAIL PLANNING KNOWLEDGE BASE UPDATE 2011**  
**(Material published during 2010)**

## GENERAL TEXTS

1/1

Elms, J., Canning, C., Kervenoael, R. de, Whysall, P. and Hallsworth, A.

30 years of retail change: where (and how) do you shop?

**International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 38(11/12), 2010, 817-

827. Email: [j.r.elms@stir.ac.uk](mailto:j.r.elms@stir.ac.uk)

Going back 30 years the article highlights themes and forecasts which were important. These are then explored in terms of retail change and the current issues which are of concern. Some issues such as retail saturation, loss of fascias and the future of the high street have been of on-going concern. Unforeseen changes such as the rise of ready meals, discounters, superstore diversification, regeneration stores and the fascia test are discussed. These examples are presented using a resistance framework which groups responses to change under customer, government, retailer and non-government group headers.

1/2

Lennie, L.

**Scotland's shops,**

Edinburgh: Historic Scotland, 2010, 199p.

An architectural study of shops with an emphasis on the importance of historic shop frontage conservation. The work is thoroughly researched and has a wealth of images.

Scotland

## THEORETICAL WORK

2/1

Moiseeva, A. and Timmermans, H.

Inputting relevant information from multi-day GPS tracers for retail planning and management using data fusion and context sensitive learning,

**Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services**, 17(3), 2010, 189-194. (Email:

[A.Moiseeva@tue.nl](mailto:A.Moiseeva@tue.nl))

The use of tracking devices such as GPS systems has the potential to provide a new source of data on shopping patterns. The data would be more accurate as it is not reliant on memory of trips made. An example of how the data can be used is reported.

Data, Shopping patterns

2/2

Reynolds, J. and Woods, S.

Location decision making in retail firms: evolution and challenge,

**International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 38(11/12), 2010, 828-845.

(Email: [Jonathan.Reynolds@sbs.ox.ac.uk](mailto:Jonathan.Reynolds@sbs.ox.ac.uk) )

The article starts with a review of retail location planning and the trend towards the use of more sophisticated techniques in place of 'gut feel' and experience. The core of the paper presents the results of a survey of retail location departments within a variety of retail companies. The departments were frequently small. Changing use of techniques has seen a greater use of GIS and a consolidation of techniques. The study shows that location planning relies on a mix of codified knowledge and tacit based knowledge maintaining a practical base. Their role is focused however on new store development rather than on refurbishment or disposal. The role of the retail location department within organisational structures is considered. Internal legitimacy remains an issue in retail companies for location departments.

Retail Location

2/3

Reynolds, J. and Wood, S.

Retail location planning: the state of the art,

**Retail Digest**, 2010. (Email: [Jonathan.Reynolds@sbs.ox.ac.uk](mailto:Jonathan.Reynolds@sbs.ox.ac.uk) )

A discussion of the changing balance in the use of experience and analytical techniques by store location departments. Data from a survey of retail location departments is presented. It is often still regarded as a backroom job and the issues which the departments address remain focused on new developments and the potential of the expertise developed is not applied to refurbishments or disposals. There is potential for greater integration of GIS expertise across retail organisations.

Retail location

2/4

Shen, Z., Yaop, X., Kavakani, M. and Chen, P.

Simulating spatial market share patterns for impact analysis of large scale shopping centres on downtown revitalisation,  
**Environment and Planning B**, 38(1), 2011, 142-162.

A technical article about an urban support tool which uses a multi-agent simulation approach to assess impacts of retail change.

Impact

2/5

Teller, C. and Elms, J.

Managing the attractiveness of evolved and created retail agglomerations formats,

**Marketing Intelligence and Planning**, 28(1), 2010, 25-45. Email:

[christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk](mailto:christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk)

This paper begins by making a distinction between evolved and created agglomerations counterpoising town centres and retail strips with shopping centres and retail parks. This paper builds a model to test for differences in the attractiveness and competitiveness of these types of agglomeration. It contests other literatures which have cited aspects of the physical environment such as accessibility. The results in this paper favour factors such as tenant mix, product range and atmosphere, regardless of format. The implications of this are that there is a need for retailers in evolved formats to work more closely together to ensure that they have an attractive offer in terms of product range, tenant mix and atmosphere.

Town centres, Shopping centres, Tenant mix

2/6

Teller, C., Elms, J., Thomson, J. and Paddison, A.

Place marketing and retail agglomerations,

**Place Branding and Public Diplomacy**, 6, 2010, 124-133. Email:

[christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk](mailto:christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk)

A study of key drivers of place attractiveness of evolved shopping centres in the context of decision making about the potential for place marketing of evolved (rather than managed) centres. The research is based on survey work involving 500 face to face interviews of town centre shoppers. This shows the importance of users perceptions as opposed to place actor's strategic needs. .

## RETAIL FORMATS

3/1

Clarke, I. and Banga, S.

The economic and social role of small stores: a review of UK evidence,

**International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research**, 20(2), 2010, 187-

215. Email: [i.clarke@newcastle.ac.uk](mailto:i.clarke@newcastle.ac.uk)

This paper carries out a systematic literature review of material on planning and small shops with an emphasis on the social and economic role of small shops. The key finding from the paper is that the range of shops should be seen not as divided between top up and weekly shopping but as one market because this is the way that consumers view it. They seek different products and achieve different other goals by using a variety of stores.

Small shops

3/2

Coca-Stefaniak, J., Parker, C. And Rees, P.

Localisation as a marketing strategy for small retailers,

**International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 38(9), 2010, 677-697.

Email: [p.l.rees@mmu.ac.uk](mailto:p.l.rees@mmu.ac.uk)

This paper starts from the perspective that whilst globalisation has received much attention retailing has an intrinsically local dimension. SME retailing needs to make the most of the local context. It suggests that just as in globalisation the process of internationalisation show important cross-cultural differences and similarities cross-cultural differences and similarities may be important in understanding how SME retailers understand localisation. SME retailers in Perth and Seville are compared. Results show that differences in understanding of place is significant in who the marketing is directed to. Important differences also exist in the support for SME retailers, with support more localised in Spain.

Small shops, Spain, Perth

3/3

Hallsworth, A.

Small shop decline: shadow boxing in the dark?

**Environment and Planning A**, 42, 2010, 1258-1263. Email: [a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk](mailto:a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk)

Hallsworth uses a study by Sadun (**Does planning regulation protect independent retailers?** London: London School of Economics and Political Science, Centre for Economic Performance, 2008, 39p. Centre for Economic Performance Discussion Paper 888) to highlight the problems in resolving the debate about the welfare of the small shop sector. Sadun's counterintuitive findings regarding small shop growth and the idea that they benefit from large supermarkets is used as a backcloth to highlight what figures are being used, the type of analysis being used and the lack of consistency between the findings of different groups and researchers. Hallsworth describes this as shadow boxing and makes a plea for more considered studies which probe the real place of small shops in communities and not just from an economic perspective.

Small Shops, Competition Commission

3/4

London Assembly

**Cornered shops: London's small shops and the planning system**

London: London Assembly, 2010, 76p.

[www.london.gov.uk/sites/default/files/Final%20draft%20small%20shops\\_0.pdf](http://www.london.gov.uk/sites/default/files/Final%20draft%20small%20shops_0.pdf)

See also: **Planning**, 30/7/10, 1.

This substantial report looks at how the planning system can be used to help protect small shops. Small shops are defined as less than 80 sq metres and as independently owned. The concept behind the paper is that all residents should have access to local 'essential services' and that small shops are best placed to fulfil this role in the context of the emerging idea of lifetime neighbourhoods. Three particular aspects of the planning system are examined. Use classes are studied and ways of changing these to reflect the needs of small shops and essential services are suggested. Section 106 agreements are studied with the idea that returns can be used to improve local high street environments. With reference to PPS4 it is unclear what the implications will be for small shops but monitoring of it is urged. It is accepted that policy will not be enough and that consumers have to want to shop locally. A section reviews initiatives to encourage local shopping.

London, Small shops

3/5

Roger Tym

**London Small Shops Study 2010**

London: Roger Tym & Partners, 2010, 100p. Available online [www.london.gov.uk/shaping-london/london-plan/strategy/download.jsp](http://www.london.gov.uk/shaping-london/london-plan/strategy/download.jsp)

See also: **Planning**, 30/7/10, 1.

This major study set out to quantify small shop provision in London and to explore whether Section 106 agreements could be used to support small shops. It also sought to assess the impact of small shops policy on large new retail development and its role in addressing consumer demand. Key sections outline the policy context with reference to PPS4, the small shop issue emphasising the contribution of small shops and how to make small shops affordable, the provision of small shops in London by centre, case studies, planning scenarios and policy issues. It was suggested that 80 sq m gross floorspace should be the upper definition for a small shop. Small shops were seen to benefit local areas but that in some areas decline of small shops had impacted on local choice. The report makes suggestions for how small shops can be better prioritised within a planning context and how Section 106 agreements might be used to help provision of small shops.

London, Small shops

3/6

Regeneris Consulting

**London's retail street markets – draft final report,**

London: Regeneris Consulting, 2010, 75p. Available online [www.london.gov.uk/shaping-london/london-plan/strategy/download.jsp](http://www.london.gov.uk/shaping-london/london-plan/strategy/download.jsp)

London has 162 markets. In this study the economic role of the markets, their key characteristics, the wider context of trends in markets and current policy on markets are considered. The report presents a wealth of comparative data on the London street markets. It is suggested that greater coordination of markets is required, particularly if markets are to benefit from contemporary consumer trends in the use of markets.

London, Markets

3/7

Weingaertner, C. and Barber, A.

Urban regeneration and socio-economic sustainability: a role for established small food outlets,

**European Planning Studies**, 18(10), 2010, 1653-1674. [carina.weingaertner@gmail.com](mailto:carina.weingaertner@gmail.com)

Eastside in Birmingham is the focus of this paper. Regeneration often prioritises flagship developments and established businesses are neglected. Key problems for such businesses with reference to food outlets are highlighted. A lack of information made it difficult for small businesses to envisage or plan for change. The transition period proved hard as their customer bases were destroyed with the demolition of factories and housing. The new residents in the area did not have the same preferences as the previous residents. This was particularly challenging for existing businesses. Following regeneration new businesses emerge but these do not contribute to the identity of the area in the same way. Business linkages were also lost and it was difficult for existing businesses to make new networks.

Regeneration

## RETAIL LOCATIONS

4/1

Bennison, D., Warnaby, G. and Pal, J.

Local shopping in the UK: towards a synthesis of business and place,

**International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 38(11/12), 2010, 816-864.

Email: [d.bennison@mmu.ac.uk](mailto:d.bennison@mmu.ac.uk)

The article coins the term local shopping places to underpin the central thesis that places are fundamental to the future of small shops and neighbourhood and suburban retailing. The drivers of change are seen to be aspects of local places as much as wider structural change such as supermarkets. Some data from the Local Data Company is used for illustrative purposes. The business place relationship is seen as key to the future and ways of furthering place management in local centres should be explored.

Neighbourhood retailing, Small shops, Place management

4/2

Cox, E., Squires, P., Ryan-Collins, J. and Potts, R.

**Re-imagining the high street,**

London: New Economics Foundation, 2010, 48p. 9781904882824 Available from

[www.neweconomics.org](http://www.neweconomics.org)

See also: **Planning** 24/9/10, 28, **Planning**, 29/10/10, 8.

This report repeats the exercise of 2005 to examine whether town centres are becoming more and more similar and losing the identity that comes from a large independent small shop sector. The new report goes further describing a scenario for the future which integrates with the concept of the 'Big Society' in terms of creating vital high streets based on local community initiatives from tool sharing to local credit schemes using concepts such as transition towns. The main part of the report presents the survey results and expands on particular examples of clone and home towns.

Clone towns

4/3

Stepek, M.

**Family business and town centre regeneration,**

Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2010, 10p. Briefing Paper 7 Available online

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-)

[Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres)

A report on the findings from workshops held with family run businesses and a telephone survey of family businesses. Discussions focused on the role of family businesses in towns.

Small shops, Scotland

## RETAIL PLANNING PRACTICE

5/1

CABE

### **Supermarket-led development: asset or liability?**

London: Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment, 2010, 15p.

[www.cabe.org.uk/publications/listing?tag=Planning&tagId=48&type=publications](http://www.cabe.org.uk/publications/listing?tag=Planning&tagId=48&type=publications)

See also: **Planning** 26/11/10, 4.

A response to the increasingly difficult task of separating out the design impacts from economic impacts arising from the size, design and setting of supermarkets. There is a need for stores to create a sense of place rather than to diminish any existing sense of place. The reliance on standard solutions can mean that a store can become a liability rather than an asset and some examples are described. This is followed by suggestions for good design which include relating the building to the neighbourhood, achieving strong environmental credentials, creating good public realm and planning for the long term. Planners must use their position to ensure that benefits of good design are maximised.

Town centre, Urban design

5/2

Chang, M., Ellis, H. and Mannion, F.

Spatial planning for health,

London: The Hyde Group and Town and country Planning Association, 2010, 43p. Available

online [www.tcpa.org.uk/data/files/spatial\\_planning\\_for\\_health.pdf](http://www.tcpa.org.uk/data/files/spatial_planning_for_health.pdf)

This is a guide to embedding the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment in spatial planning. Guidance on access to fresh food is one of the categories included in the report.

Diet, Food retailing

5/3

Competition Commission

### **Groceries market investigation (controlled land) order**

#### **Explanatory note to accompany the groceries market investigation (controlled land) order**

#### **The groceries market investigation (controlled land) order: Notice of making an order**

#### **The groceries market investigation (controlled land) order: response to consultation**

London: Competition Commission, 2010.

[www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery)

The final documents putting in place the proposals to reduce restrictive covenants on land held by supermarket operators. The various reports detail the new legislation on covenants, exclusivity agreements, exceptions and definitions. The responses which the Commission received on the draft version and the modifications made are also detailed.

Competition, Property

5/4

Competition Commission

**Groceries market investigation: Selection of drive time software to construct 10 minute drive time isochrones,**

London: Competition Commission. 2010. Available online [www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery)

Although it appeared that the Competition Commission had made a recommendation about the software which it favoured for use in defining 10 minute drive time isochrones as part of the competition test it has since become aware of a range of other potential software. The final decision on the choice of software will now be made by the Office of Fair Trading.

Competition

5/5

Department of Communities and Local Government

**Meanwhile use lease and guidance notes,**

London: DCLG, 2010, 14p. 97814098101246 Available online [www.communitis.gov.uk](http://www.communitis.gov.uk)

Meanwhile use leases have been prepared as part of the Communities and Local Government Meanwhile Project as a means of encouraging the temporary occupation of vacant town centre property thus contributing to town centre viability. Temporary occupation may be non-retail such as charitable groups, or creative projects. The intention is to make such leases easier and simpler. Terms and specification of the lease are given in the document.

Property, Town centre

5/6

Department for Communities and Local Government

**Proposed changes to the publication of statistics on land use change, commercial floorspace and town centre/retail development,**

London: DCLG, 2010, 6p. 9781409825876 Available online at [www.communities.gov.uk](http://www.communities.gov.uk)

The results of consultation on proposals to change the publication of **Land Use Change Statistics** and to change the coverage and frequency of publication of **Commercial and Industrial Floorspace**. An annual publication of **Land Use Change Statistics** was considered to be sufficient. With respect to **Commercial and Industrial Floorspace** biennial publication would be acceptable although greater geographic disaggregation is desired.

Data

5/7

Department of Communities and Local Government

**Retail markets: management models,**

London: DCLG, 2010, 16p. 9781409825586 Available online [www.communities.gov.uk](http://www.communities.gov.uk)

The management of markets is recognised as crucial to the success and viability of markets. The guide provides details of different management models as a way of enabling market those operating markets to choose the model most appropriate to them. Local authority, private, trader, voluntary sector and partnership models are included with benefits and dis-benefits of each type.

## Markets

5/8

Department of Communities and Local Government

### **Retail markets: a good practice guide,**

London: DCLG, 2010, 17p. 9781409825593 Available online [www.communities.gov.uk](http://www.communities.gov.uk)

The guide highlights areas of good practice and signposts users to sources of more detailed information. The guide has 4 sections: engaging key partners, supporting micro-business, supporting communities and marketing and PR. Specific markets are used as examples of good practice. The network structures within which markets should operate are outlined.

## Markets

5/9

Department of Communities and Local Government

### **A plain English guide to the Localism Bill,**

London: Department of Communities and Local Government, 18p, 1011. Available online [www.communities.gov.uk](http://www.communities.gov.uk)

A user friendly resume of the new proposals for local plan making.

5/10

Eaglesfield, J.

Competition rule changes impact on land agreements and protection of trade,

**Strategic Direction**, 27(1), 2011, 7. Email: [janine.eaglesfield@gordonsllp.com](mailto:janine.eaglesfield@gordonsllp.com)

A review of the Competition Commission Groceries Market Investigation controlled land order. The review highlights the five year period in which exclusivity will be allowed noting that this is essential to building up the trade of a new store. It also notes that even with this order the planning system will remain the key regulatory tool for determining future retail locations.

## Competition, Property

5/11

Guy, C.

Whose looking after the shops?

**Town and Country Planning**, 79 (Oct), 2010, 411-413. Email: [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk)

The proposed end to Regional Development Agencies and Regional Spatial Strategies raises issues relating to the definition of network of towns. In reality the establishment of these networks at the regional level was not particularly useful. At the sub-regional level it is more important as planners can direct development to appropriate locations. The use of capacity assessments would be the most useful mechanism at this level and it would be good to see this incorporated within the new Local Economic Partnership remit.

## Regional Spatial Strategies

5/12

Guy, C.

New in town,

**Town and Country Planning**, 80 (Jan) 2010, 9-11. Email: [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk)

A consideration of the impact of in town foodstores. Evidence from studies of trading impacts suggests that these are broadly positive. Traffic impacts may be less positive with increased congestion despite the increased accessibility of the site by other modes of transport. Noise may be a problem as there has been concern about how stores integrate into the existing urban fabric. From a planning perspective policy is oriented to directing developments to town centres rather than considering how they can be accommodated satisfactorily in such a way as to maximise the benefits and minimise the negative aspects. It has been suggested that changing class uses to distinguish supermarket uses from other A1 uses might be a useful way forward.

Town centre, Food retailing, Class uses

5/13

Guy, C

Election fever,

**Town and Country Planning**, 79 (April), 2010, 163-165. Email: [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk)

A resume of PPS4 noting the changes from PPS6. In view of the then upcoming election the article considers where the parties stand on key aspects of PPS4. The Conservative Party seemed to demand greater control with less legislation. The Liberal Party would demand plans for local retail development and a local competition test. All parties emphasise retail diversity, small shops and fair competition and are against large developments in out of town locations. Negativity towards development is common to all three.

PPS4

5/14

Hastings, T.

**A review: Wrigley, N., Lambiri, D., Cudworth, K., 2010, Revisiting the impact of large foodstores on market towns and district centres, University of Southampton: School of Geography,**

Farnborough: Association of Convenience Stores, Oxford: Oxford Institute of Retail Management, 2011, 10p. Available online: [www.acs.org.uk](http://www.acs.org.uk)

A critique of the paper by Wrigley et al.. Key points raised are the selective interpretation of earlier data, the premature time frame for results and the interpretation of trader views. Additionally several issues are raised with the case studies. The review concludes by noting that the paper focused on the common ground, based on averages, rather than on the disparate nature of the case studies.

Food retailing

5/15

House of Commons

**Localism Bill,**

London: House of Commons, 17 February, 2011, 46p. Available online [www.publications.parliament.uk](http://www.publications.parliament.uk)

Text of the debate on the Localism Bill including statements on policy on town centres and PPS4.

PPS4

5/16

House of Commons

Local high streets,

**Hansard**, 21 Dec, 2010. Available online [www.publications.parliament.uk](http://www.publications.parliament.uk)

A debate on the role of local high streets and the commitment of the government to ensuring that the role of town centres will remain key to policy. The debate includes an affirmation of government commitment to high streets and a statement that localism will benefit high streets as it will be community driven. Issues of rates relief, improvements to high streets and vacant shops are discussed.

Town centres

5/17

House of Commons

Urban supermarkets,

**Hansard**, 13 Sep 2010. Available online: [www.publications.parliament.uk](http://www.publications.parliament.uk)

A parliamentary debate on supermarket planning issues in town centres. Concern is expressed that many of these units did not require planning consent as no change of use was involved but that they can cause considerable changes for the local residents. Various issues are raised such as noise, use of marquees, refrigeration units. The debate picks up the issue of use classes and whether a new use class system would be better. The idea was received with the reply that increased bureaucracy was undesirable but that in due course a more consolidated national planning framework will be published.

Class uses, Food retailing, Town centre

5/18

Hughes, R., Hallsworth, A. and Clarke, G.

Testing the effectiveness of the proposed UK 'competition test',

**Service Industries Journal**, 29(5), 2009, 569-590. Email: [a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk](mailto:a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk)

How will the fascia or competition test impact on the expansion of major retailers. The article takes example areas in Swindon and Leeds/Harrogate to test out whether an existing dominant retailer will still be able to expand and whether an emergent retailer in a crowded area will find new sites that conform to the fascia test rules. The results show that it is likely that there is still scope for expansion in both types of areas. The 10 minute drive rule means affords a lot of room for infill reopening the saturation debate. Criticisms of the policy include the fact that it is only concerned with supermarkets, that it assumes a static picture with only 4 major retailers, that it ignores the discount sector and that it is only taking

account of large retail spaces. This last point means that fascia dominated towns will still exist and emerge.

Competition Commission, Food retailing

5/19

Liberal Democrats

**Vibrant local high streets,**

London: Liberal Democrats, 2010, 6p. Available online at:

[www.libdems.org.uk/site/Files/resources/PDF/Vibrant%20Local%20Streets.pdf](http://www.libdems.org.uk/site/Files/resources/PDF/Vibrant%20Local%20Streets.pdf)

Vibrant high streets are viewed a part of the DNA of communities. The vision of the Liberal Democrats is to stop the decline of high streets and even the playing field between small and large businesses. A reform of business rates, access to credit, a localised approach to competition and new roles for the Post Office are suggested. Business rates do not reflect turnover, creating unfairness. Business rate relief would be made automatic. A better check on the costs of regulation should also take place. A local competition office in the Office of Fair Trading is proposed to investigate local competition issues.

Competition, Rates, Town centre

5/20

Mabutt, A.

**Open source planning,**

London: Conservative Party, 2010, 22p. Planning Green Paper14. Available online

[www.conservatives.com/~media/Files/.../planning-green-paper.ashx](http://www.conservatives.com/~media/Files/.../planning-green-paper.ashx)

A pre-election policy paper on the future of planning under a Conservative government. The unpicking of the centralised system operated by Labour involves abolishing regional spatial strategies and local development frameworks in favour a new local plan. The local plan would be a bottom-up plan involving collaborative democracy at the lowest level with the engagement of all residents in a neighbourhood participating in the plan making process. With respect to town centres the policy paper expresses the intention of the Conservative party to reinstate the needs test.

PPS4

5/21

Pickles, E.

**Heart of the community,**

Speech presented at the Association of Convenience Stores Conference, London, 2010.

Available online [www.communities.gov.uk](http://www.communities.gov.uk)

This speech affirms the new government's intentions to continue their commitment to town centres. It makes clear that policy is intended not to favour particular development but to ensure the right development is in the right place. The wider policy agenda is then presented noting the proposals for reform of the national planning framework, local enterprise partnerships, the role of communities in planning, ways of working together, community right to build and presumption in favour of sustainable development. Specifically communities might have the right to buy the local shop. New local dynamism will encourage

economic growth and hence support town centres. Some measures on rates relief are outlined. The overall message of the speech is the emphasis on local decision making.

Town centres

5/22

Wood, S., Lowe, M. and Wrigley, N.

Conceptualising innovative customer-facing responses to planning regulation: the UK food retailers,

**Service Industries Journal**, 30(12), 2010, 1967-1990. Email: [N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk](mailto:N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk)

Tightening regulation challenged retailers to develop maintaining their brand identity whilst at the same time responding to new circumstances. The way in which retail operators conceive their brand strategy and build into their strategic management a capacity for adaptation to changing regulation has affected the ability of UK retailers to grow in the face of tightening regulation. The different responses to tightening of regulation from format development, the development of other activities, location strategy, engagement with policy making and contesting policy have all been important. Key to has been their awareness and investment in collecting and using customer based information.

Food retailing, PPS6

5/23

Wrigley, N., Lambiri, D. And Cudworth, K.

**Revisiting the impact of large foodstores on market towns and district centres.**

Southampton: University of Southampton, Department of Geography, 2010, 248p.

See also: **Planning** 10/12/10, 4. Email: [N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk](mailto:N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk)

This study takes the theme of the DETR1992-1996 study (The Impact of Large Foodstores on Market Towns and District Centres, DETR, 1998) and tests out the impact of superstores and large foodstores in a set of similar locations. The period 2007-2009 is used to obtain and before and after data on 8 centres with interviews of traders and consumers. It is concluded that edge of centre stores do not have a negative impact on existing centres and indeed may have positive benefits in generating linked trips and encouraging clawback and more localised shopping.

Food retailing, Town centres

## CONSUMER CULTURE

6/1

Bedore, M.

Just urban food systems: a new direction for food access and urban social justice

**Geography Compass**, 4(9), 2010, 1418-1432.

This article proposes that consideration of food deserts should be set within a justice context. This would offer a more meaningful framework not just for assessing how to cope with issues of food access but ensuring that wider issues of food provision were assessed.

Food deserts

6/2

Caraher, M., Lloyd, S., Lawton, J. and Sing, G.

A tale of two cities: a study of access to food: lessons for public health,

**Health Education Journal**, 69(2), 2010, 200-210. Email: [m.caraher@city.ac.uk](mailto:m.caraher@city.ac.uk)

A study of two deprived areas in Preston. There were significant contrasts between the ethnically dominated area and the other area in terms of availability and affordability of food. The ethnically dominated area had greater availability of affordable food and small shops competed well with large foodstores. It showed that a combination of structural and individual influences were at work. The project used the 'Eatwell plate' concept.

Preston, Food retailing, Consumer groups

6/3

Guy, C.

Trading non-places,

**Town and Country Planning**, 79 (Jul/Aug), 2010, 311-313. Email: [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk)

The growth in online sales has been faster than predicted but the closure of shops as a result has been less. This in part reflects the sectors where online shopping has grown but also increased purchasing overall. The article seeks to assess the unevenness of the impact of increased online sales with reference to different types of retail locations and in particular different types of high street.

E-retailing, Town centres

6/4

McEachern, M., Warnaby, G., Carrigan, M. and Smizgin, I.

Thinking locally, acting locally? Conscious consumers and farmers' markets,

**Journal of Marketing Management**, 26(5), 2010, 395-412. Email:

[m.mceachern@lancaster.ac.uk](mailto:m.mceachern@lancaster.ac.uk)

This paper takes the context of ethical consumption as its starting point for considering farmers' markets. The interest is not in customers of farmers' markets but on how those most committed to aspects of ethical consumption view shopping at farmers' markets. Whilst it might be expected that those most committed to ethical production, short food miles, and

locally produced goods would be attracted to farmers' markets they still view these as largely a leisure attraction. Such consumers are engaged in making choices between their perceptions of different ethical positions held by major supermarkets as much as they are about buying from markets. This perspective counterbalances studies of market patrons and suggests lessons for markets in trying to attract more trade from those who would be their most natural customers.

Farmers' markets

6/5

Wrigley, N., Cudworth, K. And Lambiri, D.

Further evidence on linked trips and foodstore development,

**Town and Country Planning**, 79 (April), 2010, 187-190. Email: [N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk](mailto:N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk)

Data from a wider study of the impact of large foodstores on market towns and district centres is used to study the change in linked trips which occurs when new edge of centre stores open. The study shows that some increase in linked trips occurs. A model of the factors which will impact on how many linked trips will be made is proposed and some calibration of expected levels of linked trips included. The importance of clawback and switching in linked trip propensity are noted.

Linked trips, Food retailing

## URBAN ENVIRONMENT

7/1

Berry, J., Godfrey, A., McGreal, S. and Adair, A.

Business improvement districts in Great Britain: governance, finance and stakeholder agreement,

**Journal of Town and City Management**, 1(2), 2010, 128-147.

The aim of this paper is to assess the effectiveness of the legislative and pilot BID arrangements operating in Great Britain on governance, financing and stakeholder engagement by drawing on evidence from experts and case studies. Accountability and business planning are critical to gaining business support.

Business improvement districts

7/2

British Retail Consortium, Inter Bank Rating Forum and British BIDs,

**Industry criteria and guidance notes for BIDs,**

London: BRC, IBRF and British Bids, 2010, 8p. [www.brc.org.uk](http://www.brc.org.uk)

The notes set out the 'essentials' for a BID proposal noting aspects such as the business case, levy calculation, performance measurement and additionality. Further desirable characteristics are then presented including management costs, additional funding, exclusions and registration. The section on BID plans themselves emphasise transparency, robust business case and clear aims and impacts. The recommended number of businesses for a BID is 300-700. Costs and management are also outlined. A brief section considers renewal of BIDs and makes the distinction between delivery and impact.

Business Improvement Districts

7/3

Department for Business, Innovation and Skills

**Healthy high street? A health check for high streets and town centres,**

London: Department of Business, Innovation and Skills, 2010, 20p. Available from:

[www.bcsc.org.uk/media/downloads/10-1224-healthy-high-street.pdf](http://www.bcsc.org.uk/media/downloads/10-1224-healthy-high-street.pdf)

A brief paper which is intended as a practical tool for assessing the health of high streets. There is a 5 minute checklist, a list of warning signs and some suggestions of ways forward. The emphasis is not on the selection of indicators but on ensuring the correct interpretation of potential indicators by establishing the context of change. It urges vigilance and assurance that some responsibility for monitoring and action has been established.

Town centre

7/4

Grossman, S.

Elements of public-private partnership management: examining the promise and performance criteria of Business Improvement Districts,

**Journal of Town and City Management**, 1-2 (2010), 148-163. Email: [cpsgrossman@aol.com](mailto:cpsgrossman@aol.com)

BIDs are defined as the meeting point of private and public interests working in partnership in the belief that a collective approach can deliver benefits not achievable by either private individuals nor public authorities. Its success should be assessed in terms of its contribution to social capital, public entrepreneurship and public private partnership. The article stresses the integral importance of the collective rather than the economic success of the individual and of the contributing to the community which BIDs can offer.

Business Improvement Districts

7/5

Guy, C.

The credit crunch and power relations in UK retail property,

**Environment and Planning A** 42, 2010, 1017-1022. Email: [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk)

In recession it is possible for relationships within the property market to change. Guy suggests that although retailers were increasing pressure on property owners regarding shorter and more flexible leases the events of the recession, for example the use of CVAs, have seen this increase. It may be that such pressure may not be a passing trend associated with recession but may be a trend which will forever change the owner/ lessee relationship with retailers exacting leases which permit them quicker responses to changing economic situations.

Property

7/6

Hughes, T.

**Social enterprises and town centre regeneration,**

Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2010, 10p. Briefing Paper 24. Available online

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres)

Consideration of the potential and existing roles of social enterprises in town centre regeneration. It is recognised that there are image issues associated with social enterprises and their engagement in regeneration. Some suggested routes forward are proposed.

Regeneration, Scotland, Town centre

7/7

Jackson, C. and Watkins, C.

Planning, policy and retail property investment in the UK,

**Urban Studies**, Published online on 17 Jan, 2011. Email: [c.c.jackson@sheffield.ac.uk](mailto:c.c.jackson@sheffield.ac.uk)

It is known that financial institutions consider planning policy implications in their assessment of future investments. The paper examines how this occurs in the case of shop investment in high streets. Using a six stage model of the investment process a series of interviews were used to assess at what points and in what ways planning information was used. The information on planning is often very subjective. However planners' responses

were shown to be important in the decision to invest with proactive interested planners favoured. Equally more proactive towns with management schemes are more attractive as there is greater demonstrable commitment to the future of the high street. Use of pipeline data is also important for capitalisation and yield calculations.

Property

7/8

Jones, C.

The rise and fall of the high street shop as an investment class,

**Journal of Property Investment and Finance**, 28 (4), 2010, 275-284. Email:

[c.a.jones@hw.ac.uk](mailto:c.a.jones@hw.ac.uk)

High street shops were once seen as an attractive part of institutional property portfolios. The number of units owned by financial institutions has fallen. The changing role of the high street and the expansion of out of town retail parks have contributed to this. Recession has also increased uncertainty about high street property. However the study shows that a more important factor has been change in the way that financial institutions look at their property investments. A new short-termism has meant that the contribution of small high street shops can no longer make the same impact on portfolio performance and there is a preference for larger investments such as shopping centres or retail parks.

Property

7/9

Peel, D. and Lloyd, M. G.

Wrestling with the value added of Business Improvement Districts: efficiency, accountability and contractual governance in Scotland,

**Public Performance and Management**, 33(3), 2010, 488-508. Email: [d.peel@ulster.ac.uk](mailto:d.peel@ulster.ac.uk)

Stressing the importance of additionality for the traders in a Business Improvement District this article focuses on how contractual service agreements facilitate the assessment and perception of whether the Bid offers services over and above those provided by the local authority in Scotland.

Business Improvement Districts

7/10

Reid, P.

**Learning and networking to support growth and change in towns,**

Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2010, 7p. Briefing Paper 2. Available online

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres)

Shared practice and learning opportunities are explored. The paper seeks to determine which tools, and activities are most effective and gives examples of learning opportunities.

Networks, Scotland

7/11

Royal Society of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce

**Business Improvement districts: connecting business and the community,**

London: Royal Society of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce, 2010, 8p.

[www.thersa.org/data/assets/pdf\\_file/0003/357843/Business\\_Improvement\\_Districts.pdf](http://www.thersa.org/data/assets/pdf_file/0003/357843/Business_Improvement_Districts.pdf)

The RSA convened a seminar to explore the concept of business improvement districts to consider how they might expand, their remit, their links to the community and the balance between social and economic goals. It highlights the constraints of BIDs in terms of community involvement and the requirement to adhere to the business plan. The role of landlords in BIDs in the future was discussed. A number of conclusions about how to make BIDs work better are listed. The ending of the Regional Development Agencies who have been involved in seed funding is problematic but it is hoped that the Local Enterprise Partnerships will continue to support BIDs but better awareness of the role of BIDS and engagement with the community are required if this is to be achieved.

Business Improvement Districts

7/12

Scottish Government

**Designing streets: a policy statement for Scotland,**

Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2010, 68p. 978075598264 Available online

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres)

This guide is intended to move towards understanding street design in a place making context. It has been written to inform the Government's place making agenda.

Scotland, Streets

7/13

**Whole town strategies: who is doing what in Scotland?**

Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2010, 12p. Briefing Paper 4. Available online

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Built-Environment/regeneration/pir/learningnetworks/towncentres)

This review maps out how local authorities and their partners are approaching town centre regeneration and the extent to which whole town strategies are part of their vision. The role of schemes such as SUSSET are noted.

Scotland, SUSSET, Whole town strategy

## **A SELECTION OF LITERATURE RELATING TO RETAIL PLANNING IN USA AND EUROPE**

8/1

Baker G. and Wood, S.

Towards robust development of retail planning policy: maintaining the viability and vitality of main street shopping precincts,

**Geographical Research**, 48(1), 2010, 65-74. Email: [rbaker1@une.edu.au](mailto:rbaker1@une.edu.au)

High streets in Eastern Australia are facing high levels of vacancy in the face of increased mobility, deregulation of trading hours and competition from dominant out of centre supermarkets. To maintain vitality and viability of high streets will require stronger planning regulations. A more robust impact assessment is called for. Currently assessment for retail proposals focuses on capacity and expenditure projections. Lessons from UK policy are cited. There is a need for much better definition of retail formats to reduce ambiguity. A series of test are suggested including a sense of place test, a hierarchical test, a sequential test a competition test and a community benefit test. A quantitative approach is proposed. The drive to address competition issues in Australia should be part of a wider policy framework.

Australia, Impact assessment

8/2

Cameron, N., Amrhein, C., Smoyer-Tomic, K., Raine, K. And Chong, L.

Concerning the market: restriction of retail supermarket locations,

**Environment and Planning C**, 28, 2010, 905-92. Email: [nairne.cameron@algomau.ca](mailto:nairne.cameron@algomau.ca)

A study of the consequences of the use of restrictive covenants in Edmonton, Canada. The covenants are used when a supermarket operator closes a store and moves to a new location. The covenant restricts what the next user may do with the site usually restricting or placing conditions on the food which may be sold. There are important consequences in terms of food access for disadvantaged groups, in this case older age groups in particular. There are also planning consequences. The site remains part of zoned retail land but is not in use as such. However no extra land may be zoned for retail use and other operators can find it difficult to obtain sites. Additionally empty buildings impinge on other regeneration initiatives.

Food retailing, Restrictive covenants, Canada

8/3

European Commission

**EU report and consultation towards more efficient and fairer retail services in the internal market for 2020,**

Brussels: EU, 2010. Available online [http://ec.europa.eu/internal\\_market/retail/index\\_en.html](http://ec.europa.eu/internal_market/retail/index_en.html)

The conference report and consultation exercise documents are available. Session 1 of the conference considered access to affordable retail services and a discussion of related planning issues.

EU

8/4

Everts, J.

Consuming and living the corner shop: belonging, remembering, socialising,  
**Social and Cultural Geography**, 11(8), 2010, 847-864. Email: [Jonathan.Everts@uni-bayreuth.de](mailto:Jonathan.Everts@uni-bayreuth.de)

An ethnographic study based in Germany focusing on the meaning that small shops have for their customers and the shopkeepers is a result of shared practices. The study focused on ethnic shops but it was not the ethnicity that defined the meaning of the shops in local shopping practices or shaped shopping behaviours. Consuming in the small shop context is shown to be a more subtle process involving interpersonal relationships focused on meeting points, trust and certainty.

Small shops, Germany

8/5

Grant, J. and Perrott, K.

Where is the cafe? The challenge of making retail uses viable in mixed-use suburban developments,  
**Urban Studies**, 48(1), 2011, 177-195. Email: [jill.grant@dal.ca](mailto:jill.grant@dal.ca)

The paper contrasts the views of planners, developers and consumers on how people shop at the community level. Taking a number of Canadian examples it is shown that mixed use developments are conceived as idealistic in terms of providing complete communities. Developers are less convinced and although planners have been pleased with the new mixed use developments, retailers have not been attracted to these developments. Mixed use plans do not guarantee mixed use developments in suburban locations.

Mixed use, Canada

8/6

Huddleston, V. and Huddleston, P.

**The impacts of retail trade deregulation: a review of evidence from other jurisdictions**,  
University of Western Australia FACTBase Bulletin, 7, 2010, 10p.

In a consideration of the various impacts of deregulation of trading hours is included discussion of whether deregulation of trading hours impacts negatively on the use of small shops exacerbating the decline of small shops. It is concluded that the available evidence makes it difficult to isolate the effect of deregulation of trading hours from other possible effects.

Australia, Small shops

8/7

Paez, A., Mercado, R., Farber, S., Morency, C. and Roorda, M.

Relative accessibility deprivation indicators for urban settings: definition and application to food deserts in Motreal,  
**Urban Studies**, 47, 2010, 1415-1436.

Opportunity landscapes are created to show levels of exclusion using indicators such as distance to shops combined with levels of car availability and income.

Canada, Food desert

8/8

Spilkova, J.

Retail development and impact assessment in Czech Republic: which tools to use?

**European Planning Studies**, 18(9), 2010, 1469-1484. [spilkova@natur.cuni.cz](mailto:spilkova@natur.cuni.cz)

Retail development in the Czech Republic has progressed relatively unregulated with the spread of large scale retail developments. The only key regulatory tools are the plans compiled by the Building Offices. There is no national planning advice on retail development. The lack of regulation is in part a reaction to the previously over centralised and regulated system. The article reports on a survey of Building offices to gauge their opinions and reactions to the possibility of a retail impact assessment tool. It is concluded that this did not receive support and that tightening up of plans offered the preferred regulatory tool.

Impact assessment, Czech Republic

8/9

Spilkova, J. and Perlin, R.

Czech physical planning at the crossroads; towards the regulation of large scale retail development,

**Environment and Planning C**, 28(2), 2010, 290-303. [spilkova@natur.cuni.cz](mailto:spilkova@natur.cuni.cz)

A review of retail change and development in the Czech Republic shows that the lack of retail planning has led to uncoordinated development, often on greenfield sites. Planners have the option now to enforce stronger regulatory practice or to coe with the after effects of retail developments, some of which will undoubtedly fail. The role of the the physical plan is considered and other the possibility of channelling other moves towards greater regulation to the control of retail development.

Czech Republic

8/10

Spilkova, J. and Sefrna, L. Uncoordinated new retail development and its impact on land and soils; a pilot study on the urban fringe of Prague, Czech republic,

**Landscape and Urban Planning**, 94(2), 2010, 141-148. [spilkova@natur.cuni.cz](mailto:spilkova@natur.cuni.cz)

A study of retail development on the periphery of Prague. The study shows the extent to which new large scale retail development has been located on prime agricultural land and that the scale of this activity demands new regulatory practice.

Czech Republic

## **PRACTITIONER LITERATURE**

9/1

Field, D.

Order revocation alters competition landscape,  
**Planning**, 15/10/10, 7.

It seems likely that the coalition government may adopt the Competition Commission proposed competition test. The article focuses on the rules concerning restrictive covenants. This comes at a time when has agreed to revoke the Land Agreement Exclusion Order of 2004. Companies will now self-assess their land agreements to check if they are in line with competition law. The intertwining of property, planning and competition concerns in the groceries sector presents new challenges with opportunities for some and restrictions for others.

Property

9/2

Grocery retail planning permission and the competition test,  
**Journal of Planning and Environment Law**, 1, 2010, 7.

An update oin the competition test position. This has now passed to the devolved governements and to the Communities and Local Government department.

Competition

9/3

Halman, G.

Clarity lost by incentive deal,  
**Planning**, 15/10/10, 7.

Section 106 agreements now have to conform to more stringent rules on what they can cover as part of the community infrastructure levy coming into effect. Excessive demands for planning gain are therefore disallowed but at the same time some flexibility has been lost. The way that the community infrastructure levy will operate remains uncertain.

Section 106 agreements

9/4

Harris, D.

A time for action,  
**Estates Gazette Retail Focus**, Winter 2010, 22-24.

Investors in shopping centres expect returns from the rentals they receive and from the increase value of their investment. With recession asset management has become more important if investors are to receive expected returns. Ensuring that the shopping centre is doing its best for tenants will ensure he best returns and increases in value in a depressed market.

Property

9/5

Kivlehan, N.

Worthy successor,

**Estates Gazette Retail Focus**, Summer 2010, 10-13.

An evaluation of Alworths which aspires to be the new Woolworths, taking stores in the high streets where Woolworths was most profitable.

Property, Vacancy

9/6

Kochan, B.

Place at the table,

**Planning**, 9/4/10, 12-13.

Attempts are being made to devise a standard for the accessibility of healthy food. This involves a survey of food retailers offering fruit and vegetables to meet 5 a day goals. Accessibility of food outlets is then assessed using drive and walking time models generating by mapping software. Rural areas were shown to be most deficient in provision. The roll out of fruit and vegetables in convenience stores across North-West England is shown to have increased patronage and profitability of these stores.

Diet, Food retailing

9/7

Kochan, B.

Supporting local trade,

**Planning**, 13/8/10, 12.

If there is to be greater consideration of local competition issues as suggested in pre-election manifestos of the coalition then there is a case for regulation which will ensure greater small shop protection. The article makes reference to the results of the London Small Shops Study. It also draws on statements from other commentators. Experts advise that there is a need to think more carefully at the level of the town centre about small shop strategies.

Small shops

9/8

Neill reveals store rethink,

**Planning**, 17/9/10, 2.

A note on permitted development rights for urban supermarkets. Although new controls could be put in place extra bureaucracy is not desirable and there may be better ways of achieving good outcomes.

PPS4

9/9

Real conviction required to prove off-site benefits,

**Planning**, 18/6/10, 9.

A discussion about the extent to which offers of off-site benefits such as the development of an adjacent site should be considered in the case of a development involving a compulsory purchase agreement. Unless a 'real' connection can be made it should not be a lawful consideration. The example selected is a competitive bid situation between Tesco and Sainsbury's.

CPO, Food retailing

9/10

Small shops power urged,

**Planning**, 12/3/10, 2.

Residents in the Royal Borough of Kensington and Chelsea are being urged to lobby government to strengthen planning to protect small shops. The move of a multiple retailer into a market area of independent retailers has triggered the move. It is suggested that local authorities should have powers to prevent two small shops merging.

Small shops

9/11

Smulian, M.

Council eyes added retail class powers,

**Planning**, 16/7/10, 4.

The London Assembly is committed to small shops and has proposed seeking a class use for shops of 80 sq m or less. They are seeking a local authority bill for London which would have additional discretionary powers which could be used to maintain small shop provision.

Small shops

9/12

Smulian, M.

Norfolk councillors to face Tesco probe,

**Planning**, 23/7/10, p.3.

For planners, remaining unbiased towards one major operator or another remains a difficult issue. The case of Norfolk is a case in point.

Competition

9/13

Smulian, M.

Working on wellbeing,

**Planning**, 3/12/10, p.13.

An explanation of the transfer of responsibility for the transfer of public health projects from NHS to local Councils. This will include access to healthy foods.

Food retailing

9/14

Sprinks, J.

Homes on shopping list,

**Planning**, 28/5/10, 6.

A discussion of the way that supermarket operators have become involved in mixed use schemes including housing and even the creation of mini villages. A number of concerns are raised including impacts on town centres, the add on activities which supermarkets may have (pharmacy, optician, post office) and the way that such schemes are integrated into existing urban fabrics. The article asks whether there should be more stringent rules on add-ons and whether PPS4 is robust enough to ensure that these schemes are the right schemes in the right place.

Food retailing, PPS4

9/15

Tests return fears voiced,

**Planning**, 21/5/10, 1.

Consultants have expressed fears of long delays if the coalition government were to decide to reintroduce the needs test.

Need test, PPS4

9/16

Thame, D.

High time for the high street,

**Estates Gazette Retail Focus**, Winter, 2010, 12-16.

Availability of well priced high quality retail space is attracting new businesses. US fashion retailers are attracted to the UK due to problems in the US market. Equally some retailers trading from concessions are using the opportunity to develop their own outlets.

Property, Recession

9/17

Thame, D.

Less is more,

**Estates Gazette Retail Focus**, Spring 2010, 32-34.

Regional retail chains have always been important in the local high street. Whilst their demise has been predicted they appear to be stronger in recession than might be expected due to the ways they are financed.

Property

9/18

Thame, D.

Lifeline or sting?

**Estates Gazette Retail Focus**, Summer 2010, 24-25.

A discussion of the way that retailers have used CVAs focusing on whether they have been used unfairly by some retailers or whether their disadvantages re outweighed by advantages.

CVAs, Property

9/19

Wilding, M.

Urban planning rewriter,

**Planning**, 2/4/10, 13.

An interview with Anna Minton, writer on the privatisation of public space. The article highlights concerns about the overly economic emphasis of planning with privatisation being privileged over other social concerns. The retail success of town centres takes precedence in thinking over their social roles shifting the balance between public and private too far. Shopping is not enough to create healthy town centres.

Town centres